

Message

---

**From:** Bahadori, Tina [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=7DA7967DCAFB4C5BBC39C666FEE31EC3-BAHADORI, TINA]  
**Sent:** 6/19/2017 10:52:17 PM  
**To:** Lambert, Jason [Lambert.Jason@epa.gov]; Segal, Deborah [Segal.Deborah@epa.gov]; Wright, Michael [Wright.Michael@epa.gov]; Vandenberg, John [Vandenberg.John@epa.gov]; Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer [Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov]  
**CC:** D'Amico, Louis [DAmico.Louis@epa.gov]; Jones, Samantha [Jones.Samantha@epa.gov]; Gatchett, Annette [Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov]; Rice, Glenn [rice.glenn@epa.gov]; Thayer, Kris [thayer.kris@epa.gov]; Hawkins, Belinda [Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** Re: Reyes and Price paper

Thanks Jason!  
Tina

---

**From:** Lambert, Jason  
**Sent:** Monday, June 19, 2017 9:28 AM  
**To:** Segal, Deborah; Wright, Michael; Vandenberg, John; Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer; Bahadori, Tina  
**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis; Jones, Samantha; Gatchett, Annette; Rice, Glenn; Thayer, Kris; Hawkins, Belinda  
**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Good morning everyone,  
Sorry; a little late to this game. I also am not trying to throw wrenches but I feel compelled to at least pitch my 2 cents in. Mike Wright had asked me to take a look at this draft manuscript early last week, so I will go ahead and provide my comments here as things look to be moving fast. I will caveat my comments below with the fact that I recognize folks are trying to do the best they can with the information at hand (e.g., NHANES urine data and TDIs), however I do have some issues with the information used and the conclusions made. Please note these are pretty much the same items I discussed with Matt Lorber a long time ago re: cumulative risk of phthalates. And, for complete transparency I reviewed an abstract from Reyes et al. (I assume for a meeting) several weeks ago on the same topic; I have pasted my track changes copy of that abstract if anyone wants to see what was said previously on the topic.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

# Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Otherwise, yes, this paper was reasonably well written.

Jason C. Lambert, PhD, DABT  
U.S. EPA, ORD, NCEA  
26 West Martin Luther King Dr.  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
(513) 569-7078 ph.  
(513) 487-2539 fax  
[lambert.jason@epa.gov](mailto:lambert.jason@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Segal, Deborah

**Sent:** Monday, June 19, 2017 8:47 AM

**To:** Wright, Michael <[Wright.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Wright.Michael@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>; Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <[Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov)>; Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Samantha <[Jones.Samantha@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Samantha@epa.gov)>; Gatchett, Annette <[Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov](mailto:Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov)>; Lambert, Jason <[Lambert.Jason@epa.gov](mailto:Lambert.Jason@epa.gov)>; Rice, Glenn <[rice.glenn@epa.gov](mailto:rice.glenn@epa.gov)>; Thayer, Kris <[thayer.kris@epa.gov](mailto:thayer.kris@epa.gov)>; Hawkins, Belinda <[Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov](mailto:Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Hello,

I reread this article on Friday, and although I am not an “*exposure*” expert, I think that this manuscript adds important information to the field of cumulative risk assessment. Although the conclusion that risk is driven by one phthalate for most people, I’m glad that the authors also indicated that, for some people, this is not the case. This is quite important as we are concerned about ensuring that susceptible individuals/populations are adequately protected. In addition, I am glad that the authors discussed the fact that they didn’t have data for young children (eg., toddlers) who potentially might be more highly exposed and perhaps more sensitive.

Overall, I found this article interesting, informative and well-written.

Thanks!

Deb

---

**From:** Wright, Michael

**Sent:** Sunday, June 18, 2017 5:30 PM

**To:** Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>; Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <[Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov)>; Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Segal, Deborah <[Segal.Deborah@epa.gov](mailto:Segal.Deborah@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Samantha <[Jones.Samantha@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Samantha@epa.gov)>; Gatchett, Annette <[Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov](mailto:Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov)>; Lambert, Jason <[Lambert.Jason@epa.gov](mailto:Lambert.Jason@epa.gov)>; Rice, Glenn <[rice.glenn@epa.gov](mailto:rice.glenn@epa.gov)>; Thayer, Kris <[thayer.kris@epa.gov](mailto:thayer.kris@epa.gov)>; Hawkins, Belinda <[Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov](mailto:Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Tina et al:

Shortly after Jen sent this around, I asked two folks here with more risk assessment expertise than myself to provide a technical review of the paper in question, given its focus on mixtures (Glenn Rice and Jason Lambert) and phthalates (Jason). I pasted Glenn’s input in blue below based on his review last week. Seems like he didn’t have any technical

concerns with it, but did raise a potential policy concern. I cc'ed Kris here too but I know she was in the loop on this earlier dissemination.

I'll follow up with Jason tmrw when he's back in the office to see if he has anything further. They are cc'ed here in case of any add'l follow-up is needed.

Thanks,

Mike

---

Glenn Rice Review of Price Paper

Summary:

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Glenn

J. Michael Wright, ScD  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
National Center for Environmental Assessment  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive (MS-A110)  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
513 569 7922 (phone)  
513 487 2539 (fax)

---

**From:** Vandenberg, John

**Sent:** Friday, June 16, 2017 8:55 AM

**To:** Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <[Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov)>; Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Wright, Michael <[Wright.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Wright.Michael@epa.gov)>; Segal, Deborah <[Segal.Deborah@epa.gov](mailto:Segal.Deborah@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Samantha <[Jones.Samantha@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Samantha@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Jen,  
I'll review as well in the next few days - please send along with Tech Ms Review forms, etc (the usual STICS entry).

Thanks

John

---

**From:** Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer

**Sent:** Friday, June 16, 2017 8:21 AM

**To:** Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>; Wright, Michael <[Wright.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Wright.Michael@epa.gov)>; Segal, Deborah <[Segal.Deborah@epa.gov](mailto:Segal.Deborah@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Samantha <[Jones.Samantha@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Samantha@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Thank you, Tina. I will let Paul know right away that NCEA clearance is necessary. The push to get this paper out is that it is an HHRA Q3 key product. Since John is the RTP Division Director, I would imagine that it should go to him. Is there anyone else who will need to clear it before deciding if it should go to the NCEA IOAA?

John, would you be able to complete this clearance review in the next few days so that, if it has to go up to the NCEA IOAA, there will still be enough time to submit it by the end of the quarter?

Thanks very much to all of you for the time and thought you are putting into this process,  
Jen

---

**From:** Bahadori, Tina

**Sent:** Friday, June 16, 2017 7:46 AM

**To:** Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <[Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>; Wright, Michael <[Wright.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Wright.Michael@epa.gov)>; Segal, Deborah <[Segal.Deborah@epa.gov](mailto:Segal.Deborah@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Samantha <[Jones.Samantha@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Samantha@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Thanks Jen. Someone at the division level needs to read the paper and either clear it there or flag it to the NCEA IOAA. Even though NERL is handling formal clearance, we still need to do our own due diligence – especially given the topic. I would love Mike's and Deb's impressions too, if they would like.

Tina

---

**From:** Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer

**Sent:** Thursday, June 15, 2017 4:57 PM

**To:** Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Kenneke, John <[Kenneke.John@epa.gov](mailto:Kenneke.John@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>; Wright, Michael <[Wright.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Wright.Michael@epa.gov)>; Segal, Deborah <[Segal.Deborah@epa.gov](mailto:Segal.Deborah@epa.gov)>; D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Samantha <[Jones.Samantha@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Samantha@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Reyes, Jeanette <[Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov](mailto:Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov)>; Price, PaulS <[Price.PaulS@epa.gov](mailto:Price.PaulS@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Hi everyone,

The Reyes and Price paper has cleared NERL and has been elevated to DC. Paul anticipates that the review will take about 2 weeks, so they have requested that any NCEA comments on the paper be returned to them by 6/26 so that they can make the Q3 deadline for this key product.

Thanks so much!  
Jen

---

**From:** Bahadori, Tina

**Sent:** Wednesday, June 14, 2017 2:10 AM

**To:** Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <[Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Reyes, Jeanette <[Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov](mailto:Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov)>; Price, PaulS <[Price.PaulS@epa.gov](mailto:Price.PaulS@epa.gov)>; D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Kenneke, John <[Kenneke.John@epa.gov](mailto:Kenneke.John@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>; Wright, Michael <[Wright.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Wright.Michael@epa.gov)>; Segal, Deborah <[Segal.Deborah@epa.gov](mailto:Segal.Deborah@epa.gov)>; D'Amico, Louis <[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov](mailto:DAmico.Louis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Samantha <[Jones.Samantha@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Samantha@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Reyes and Price paper

Thanks Jen. I noticed that NERL also put it through Advanced Notification – it would be good to get some senior NCEA eyes on this as well, should Bruce have questions.  
Tina

**From:** Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 6, 2017 9:57 PM  
**To:** Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>; D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Reyes, Jeanette <Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov>; Price, PaulS <Price.PaulS@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Reyes and Price paper

Hi everyone,

Earlier today, you should have received a courtesy copy in STICS of Reyes et al., "An analysis of cumulative risks based on biomonitoring data for six phthalates using the Maximum Cumulative Ratio." **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)**

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

This work was performed by Jeanette Reyes (ORISE post-doc stationed in NCEA) and Paul Price (NERL) under HHRA Task 6.4 (3.234 - Apportioning Multimedia Exposure and Risk Across Human and Ecological Receptors), for which I am the task lead. After much discussion with Paul and Mike Wright, we decided that it would be most appropriate for Paul to shepherd the paper through STICS, with his NERL management handling the approval and several NCEA staff provided a courtesy copy. Jeanette and Paul did a good job of presenting their results without drawing their work into the policy realm. However, a potential sensitivity is the focus on phthalates.

If you have any questions or concerns, please let me know and I will relay them to Paul and Jeanette.

Best wishes,  
Jen

Jen Richmond-Bryant, Ph.D. | Senior Physical Scientist | National Center for Environmental Assessment | 109 TW Alexander Drive, MD B243-01, Research Triangle Park, NC | office: 919-541-4518 | mobile: 919-360-1466

Notice (if this communication regards a contract): This communication shall not be considered a change in scope (affecting LOE or Cost), which may only be issued by the Contract Officer (CO). If upon receipt the Contractor determines this communication to alter the scope, please contact myself or the CO for further instruction.